

New Zealand prison interior architecture in the 1890s

Christine McCarthy, Interior Architecture, Te Herenga Waka | Victoria University

ABSTRACT: Two large New Zealand prisons opened in the 1890s: Dunedin Gaol (1895-98), designed by John Campbell, and Mount Cook Gaol (1882-97, dem 1925), designed by Pierre Finch Martineau Burrows. While Burrows had designed Mount Cook (and its sibling at Mount Eden, which was reputedly modelled on a Malta prison and colonial Blue Books) it would be Dunedin Gaol's architect, John Campbell, who would supervise the building through to completion. The two designs are very different - Dunedin having a courtyard, with echoes of Scotland Yard in London, and Mount Cook being a radial plan, the antecedent of which Newbold states to be Pentonville (London 1840-42). This paper considers the interiors of these prisons and the reasons for their differences.

Introduction

This paper examines the interiors of two New Zealand prisons built during the 1890s: Mount Cook Prison and Dunedin Gaol - both brick prisons and both part of the agenda of first New Zealand Inspector of Prisons, Arthur Hume, to materially improve the conditions and discipline of New Zealand prisons, such that:

- (a) increased accommodation would relieve overcrowded conditions,
- (b) first offenders would be housed in a different prison to habitual criminals, to prevent their moral contamination, and,
- (c) when not at work, prisoners would be housed in individual cells.¹

The 1890s in New Zealand were significant for prisons for several reasons. New Zealand's

¹ Hume "The Inspector of Prisons" (31 December 1888) p 3.

first Inspector of Prisons, Arthur Hume (1838/41-1918), had arrived in 1880,² and got two major prisons (Mount Cook and Dunedin) completed. Secondly, the intensifying economic depression (1870-c1895) meant that the public service and government departments were in various processes of retrenchment, explaining in part why only part of the Mount Cook Prison plan would be completed and why the initial plans for Dunedin Gaol were significantly down-sized.

MOUNT COOK PRISON

Mount Cook Prison - the truncated twin of the better-known Mount Eden - was designed by Pierre Finch Martineau Burrows,³ the architect who inherited William Clayton's job of

² Crawford. "Hume, Arthur" np.

³ Burrows "Enclosure in Appendix I" (31 March 1884) p 47. Hume similarly recorded that the foundations had been constructed referring to the damp proof course. Hume "Report of Inspector of Prisons" (1 June 1884) p 4.

Colonial Architect but not the title. The plan was completed in 1883, and tenders for site preparation and building the prison (and its associated brickworks) were called in 1882 and 1884.⁴ Newspaper reports in 1881 described the building as intended to be a central penal establishment.⁵ In 1884 the foundations for the first stage of building were completed, and the basement of the south wing nearly so.⁶ In 31 March 1886, the south wing was built up to 23ft, the west wing up to 12ft, and the rest up to 7ft, meaning that the second storey of the south wing was

⁴ "Parliament: House of Representatives: Friday, August 21" p 2. Burrows "Enclosure in Appendix II" (31 March 1882) p 51. Burrows "Tenders are invited "[Works at Mount Cook]" p 3. Hume. "Tenders for Mount Cook do not include" p 3.

⁵ "The proposed New Gaol" p 2.

⁶ Burrows "Enclosure in Appendix I" (31 March 1884) p 47; Hume "Report of Inspector of Prisons" (1 June 1884) p 4. Hume "The Inspector of Prisons" (31 December 1884) p 3.

nearing completion.⁷ Two years later, a height of 45ft from the basement had been built in the south wing and the engineer-in-chief was anticipating the building of the roof, and the asphaltting of the cell floors. However, delays in construction occurred from prison labour being diverted to make one and a half million bricks for the Government Printing Office.⁸

Interior description

Stacpoole has credited Burrow's design of Mount Eden prison to "an amalgam ... of ideas taken from the Blue Books which Clayton had received from England"⁹ in the early 1870s, rather than the former idea that they were "based on a prison in Malta."¹⁰ But Burrow's designs for Mount Eden and Mount Cook Prisons were also clearly influenced by HMP Wormwood Scrubs (1874), designed by Edmund du Cane, a Royal Engineer who had been involved in the construction of the

Crystal Palace (1851) and convict prisons in Australia.¹¹ Du Cane had also recommended Hume for the New Zealand prison inspector position,¹² indicating a strong connection between du Cane and Hume, who, as former deputy governor at Wormwood Scrubs,¹³ likely appreciated Wormwood Scrubs as an image of what New Zealand's prisons might look like.

Wormwood Scrubs was the first "telephone pole" plan,¹⁴ where the conventional Pentonville Model Prison (London, 1840-42) radial plan was forsaken to facilitate prisoner movement to support prisoner education and trades training. The telephone pole plan was reputedly influenced by hospital planning, such as at Herbert Hospital (Woolwich, 1859-64), where a series of pavilions was linked by a central corridor¹⁵ to maximise air-flow around buildings. Yet despite this, the usual evaluation of the interior of Wormwood

Scrub's cell blocks is that they simply replicated those at Pentonville,¹⁶ with Evans writing that Wormwood Scrubs was "a plan that relinquished central inspection but in all other respects was hardly distinguishable from the separate prisons of the forties and fifties."¹⁷

Pentonville's cell block had used a basilica architecture - a spatial genre first used for a prison by Carlo Fontana in his 1701-4 Rome House of Correction (Casa di Correzione) at San Michele's. Pentonville combined this spatial model with the geometric form and philosophy of Pennsylvania's Eastern State Penitentiary (ESP) (1821-29). The British materialisation is often credited to Joshua Jebb, though it was George Thomas Bullar of the Society for the Improvement of Prison Discipline (SIPD) who first built on John de Haviland's ESP design in his 1836 proposal to redesign Newgate Gaol.¹⁸ The design for Mount Cook Prison was consistent with this

⁷ Blackett "The Engineer-in-Chief to the Hon. the Minister for Public Work" (31 March 1886) p 39. Hume "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice" (31 March 1886) p 3.

⁸ Blackett "Appendix I. Annual Report on Roads" (31 March 1888) p 39. Hume "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice" (31 December 1887) p 3.

⁹ Stacpoole *Colonial Architecture* p 139.

¹⁰ Stacpoole *Colonial Architecture* p 139.

¹¹ Johnston *Forms of Constraint* p 95.

¹² Pratt *Punishment in a Perfect Society* p 131.

¹³ "In August that year [1874] he [Hume] was appointed deputy governor of Millbank prison in London. Between 1875 and 1880 he was successively deputy governor of Dartmoor, Portland and Wormwood Scrubs prisons." Crawford "Hume, Arthur" np.

¹⁴ Johnston *Forms of Constraint* p 97.

¹⁵ Johnston *Forms of Constraint* p 96

¹⁶ Johnston *Forms of Constraint* p 96.

¹⁷ Evans *Fabrication of Virtue* p 398.

¹⁸ Bullar "Newgate Gaol" p 5. Reports of the Inspectors pp 69-81. Crawford. Report of William Crawford, Esq. p 2, [59]

Pentonville-esque spatial concept,¹⁹ but had more staircases to support prisoner movement.

However, it was the changed status of the cell that most significantly impacted on the interior of the cell block interior. At ESP and Pentonville, prisoners were to spend 23 hours each day in their cells, with one hour of solitary exercise. This meant everything needed to live - to sleep, to work, to eat, to wash and toilet, had to be provided for within the cell - impacting on cell size and the inclusion of sanitary facilities. No longer spending 23 hours daily in their cells, prisoners at Wormwood Scrubs used ablutions in common areas, specifically corner towers at the end of cell blocks, in an example of interior architecture determining exterior form. At Mount Cook, cell sizes reduced from the Pentonville standard of 91 sqft (7' x '13' x 9') to 70 sqft (7' 3" x 9' 7 1/2" x 10').²⁰

¹⁹ It was described as a "model prison, built according to the newest designs ... of the best materials, and replete with sanitary conveniences, appliances etc." "Typhoid" p 2.

²⁰ Johnston *Forms of Constraint* p 91. Mount Cook Gaol Wellington, Ref: R25272638; Mount Cook Gaol Wellington, Ref: R25272643. Cells at Mount Cook also shared their gas-jets for lighting, which was another distinction from the Pentonville model of separate

Evans' comment that Wormwood Scrubs was "a plan that relinquished central inspection,"²¹ had particular relevance for Mount Cook, because, while at Pentonville the geometric relationship between centre and radial arm was fundamental to its inspection principle, at both Wormwood Scrubs and Mount Cook, the new regime meant that the cell blocks were self-sufficient. Even though the stereotypical view taken down the cell block nave didn't appear to change significantly,²² the experience and use of the interior architecture had. This is also why Mount Cook - initially intended to have five cell wings - could be a viable prison with only one cell block completed.

Bricks

Critical to the building of Mount Cook was the use of prison labour. Not just to build the prison, but also to produce the bricks the building was built of. Hume proudly stated that experts had proclaimed these bricks to be

provision of services, but Mount Cook was also wired for electric light. "A visit to Mount Cook Gaol" p 2; Evans *Fabrication of virtue* p 354. Hume "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice" (31 December 1896) p 3.

²¹ Evans *Fabrication of virtue* p 398.

²² "A visit to Mount Cook Gaol" p 2.

superior to those previously made in New Zealand.²³ These included bricks, tiles, water filters, urns, and "fancy bricks" requiring "coats of arms, patterns of flowers and devices of all kinds."²⁴ They were comprehensively used in government buildings, including the Government Printing Office and Parliament Buildings.²⁵ To give a sense of the scale of the operation, one kiln (possibly the Hoffman kiln) could fire over 100,000 bricks at one time.²⁶ This meant that Mount Cook Prison was materially distinct from Mount Eden, which was built of local scoria, and that the Mount Cook site provided a source of labour to occupy the prisoners and facilitate their purported reformation. This was in addition to workshops in which prisoners worked as tinsmiths, blacksmiths, carpenters, turners and cabinetmakers.²⁷ The prison's strength in brick-making, however, would also become its downfall, as in 1890 brick-making ceased at

²³ Hume "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice" (31 December 1884) p 3; Hume "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice" (31 March 1886) p 3.

²⁴ "A visit to Mount Cook Gaol" p 2.

²⁵ Hume "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice" (31 December 1887) p 3.

²⁶ "A visit to Mount Cook Gaol" p 2; Burrows "Enclosure in Appendix I" (31 March 1884) p 47.

²⁷ "A visit to Mount Cook Gaol" p 2.

the prison due to "labour troubles, and the increased cost of fuel," delaying the building of the prison.²⁸

Bricks also lent a specific surface texture and scale to the interior. But it was not an homogenous surface. Consistent with the Aesthetic Movement associated with the Queen Anne style, Mount Cook, like mid-1880s Wakefield Prison, painted an Eastlake²⁹ tripartite schema of dado, fill, and frieze onto its interiors, capped with a protruding cornice, contrasting earlier images of Eastern State Penitentiary and Pentonville.

Incompletion

By 1890 a decision had been made to complete only the south wing, and engineer Arthur Bell reported to the Minister of Works (Thomas Fergus) that:

The idea of continuing erection on the extensive lines for which the very massive and solid foundations have for some time been laid was abandoned upon your instructions; and the south wing, which alone had risen above foundation-level, has accordingly been closed by a temporary but substantial front, This wing and its

²⁸ Hume "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice" (31 December 1890) p 3.

²⁹ Eastlake *Hints on Household Taste* pp 111-112. Poore "Aesthetic Movement Interiors 1872-1889" np.

towers have also been completed and roofed, the floors boarded, and platforms and galleries of communication to cells well advanced, while a considerable amount of internal finishing has been done. The provisional kitchen and other offices necessary to enable this wing to be occupied are planned and under construction, and a large quantity of excavation and lowering of the site to the level of the intended exercise-yards has been accomplished. It is expected that the whole work will be handed over completed to the Prison authorities this year.³⁰

In March 1892, Hales reported of Mount Cook that, in the previous year:

The galleries have been erected and painted, and the ceiling-panelling done. The gas-fittings have been put in. The cell-doors have been made and fixed, and earthworks have been carried out to some extent.³¹

However, little progress was made on the construction in 1892 and 1893.³² In July 1896, Hales reported that:

³⁰ Bell "Appendix H. Report on Public Buildings by the Engineer in Charge" (31 March 1890) p 39. In 1891, acting engineer William Hales estimated that it would cost £105,000 and take about four years to complete. Hales "Cost of Mount Cook Prison" p 1.

³¹ Hales "Appendix G. Annual Report on Public Works by the Engineer-in-Chief" (31 March 1892) p 33.

³² Hume "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice" (31 December 1892) p 3; Hume "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice" (31 December 1893) pp 3-4.

The female side has been finished, except the kitchen, the excavation and fencing of the exercising-ground, and the erection of matron's quarters. On the male side the drainage has been brought up from Bank's Terrace, the basement ground-floors have been asphalted, and the fencing of the exercise-ground nearly completed. The prison should be ready for occupation about November next.³³

In December 1897, Mount Cook Prison was occupied, detaining Māori prisoners,³⁴ but the following year it was empty, Hume making reference to "a movement" to obtain the building for educational purposes.³⁵ This was likely a reference to a proposal to use the building for Victoria University College.³⁶ Additionally Member of Parliament, William Larnach, suggested that the prison be converted into a parliament, with the gaol shifted to Somes Island and Parliament House used for the proposed Middle Districts

³³ Hales "Appendix F. Annual Report on Public Works by the Engineer-in-Chief" (1 July 1896) p 57. His July 1897 report stated that the building was now ready to be occupied. Hales "Appendix F. Annual Report on Public Works by the Engineer-in-Chief" (1 July 1897) p 63.

³⁴ Hume "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice" (31 December 1897) p 3.

³⁵ Hume "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice" (31 December 1898) p 3.

³⁶ For example: "Mount Cook: University or Barracks?" p. 6; "Victoria College" p 3.

University.³⁷ In its commentary on the matter, the *Evening Post* lent its support for the prison building to house the General Assembly library, with a new parliament built on Mount Cook, writing that:

If capable architects in this city have pronounced affirmatively upon the capability of turning the wing into a University college, then its conversion into a library seems an easy thing.³⁸

It also endorsed Somes Island as a gaol location, because it would echo "St. Helena, the model island prison of Moreton Bay in Queensland."³⁹

In the end, external concerns to do with cityscape and eyesores removed the invisible occupation of incarceration instead of the edifice built to contain them.⁴⁰ Used very

briefly to imprison Māori from Parihaka, Mount Cook Prison remained vacant to the frustration of Colonel Hume, until it was transferred to the Defence Department and reclaimed as Alexandra Barracks.

DUNEDIN GAOL

Burrows, the designer of Mount Cook Prison, was also supervising architect in 1883, until he left the public service, when little known architect Daniel Mahoney became the Clerk of Works (c1886).⁴¹ It appears that it was in this capacity that Mahoney was approached by Hume to design a gaol for Dunedin (in August 1889), with plans for a radial prison being prepared in 1889.⁴²

Hume had raised concerns regarding the

limited accommodation at Dunedin, calling for a new Otago prison from at least 1886,⁴³ and he was particularly critical of the existing Dunedin gaol in his 1888 report,⁴⁴ and again in 1891, when he described the gaol as "a relic of the dark ages."⁴⁵ The following year, he referred to opposition to building a new prison on the inner-city Dunedin site, the validity of which he refuted by referring to operational expenses.⁴⁶ The City Council was the prime objector, but it had withdrawn its opposition by mid-1894 following ministerial intervention.⁴⁷ About the same time, Mahoney's design was rejected by Minister Richard Seddon on the grounds of cost, and Seddon directed a smaller gaol be built and that it be made of brick (with stone facings) because Dunedin brickmakers needed the work.⁴⁸ Seddon also supported "a lighter and

³⁷ "Parliament on Mount Cook" p 6. The *Evening Post* also supported converting Parliament buildings into a university, stating that "The two Chambers would make superb lecture - halls, the various committee-rooms would make fine class - rooms, and there are recreation grounds attached."

³⁸ "Parliament on Mount Cook" p 6.

³⁹ "Parliament on Mount Cook" p 6.

⁴⁰ Concern was also expressed that prison-made goods would compete with the free market - however by May 1898 a tax on prison goods was introduced to mitigate this concern. "No Gaol on Mount Cook" p 2.

⁴¹ Stacpoole *Colonial Architecture* p 138. "[untitled]" (18 June 1886) p 2; "Parliament: House of Representatives: Thursday, August 7" p 3; "Political Notes" p 2; "Meeting of Creditors" p 2; Our Correspondent "Action Against the Government" p 5.

⁴² Our Correspondent "Action Against the Government: Important Case" p 5. Richardson "An Architecture of Empire" p 61. "The Courts: Supreme Court" p 2; Own Correspondent "Parliamentary Gossip" p 2; "Political Notes" p 2; "Meeting of Creditors" p 2; "Mr Seddon and the New Gaol" p 4; "The Temuka Leader: Saturday, November 21, 1896" p 2; Our Correspondent "Action Against the Government" p 5. Bell "Appendix H" p 37.

⁴³ Hume "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice" (31 March 1886) pp 3-4.

⁴⁴ Hume "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice" (31 December 1888) p 4.

⁴⁵ Hume "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice" (31 December 1891) p 4.

⁴⁶ Hume "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice" (31 December 1892) p 3.

⁴⁷ House of Representatives "Dunedin Gaol" p 194.

⁴⁸ House of Representatives "Dunedin Gaol" pp 194-195. In a related manner Norman Shaw was instructed that the design for New Scotland Yard was to use "a certain

neater gaol, and one more in accordance with modern ideas."⁴⁹ The new prison was designed by John Campbell (1857-1942).⁵⁰

In 1894 work began on the new Dunedin Gaol on Castle Street, next to the old gaol.⁵¹ It was to provide separate cells for 50 men and 20 women, with the potential to enlarge it using the site of the existing gaol.⁵² The foundations for the building had begun to be dug in January 1895.⁵³ H Norman supervised the foundations, William Baskett was clerk of works, and James Hislop the consulting architect; his role described as "the technical part of the work."⁵⁴ Contemporary reports

number of tons of gray granite from Dartmoor ... in the construction of the building. Economy was the motive of this condition, for it was known that the granite could be quarried and dressed into shape at Dartmoor free of all expense save that of carriage, since the convict establishment must be maintained in any event." "New Scotland Yard" (3 May 1890) p 6.

⁴⁹ House of Representatives "Dunedin Gaol" pp 194-195.

⁵⁰ "The New Gaol" p 2. Martin *Built for Us* p 48-49.

⁵¹ "Otago Daily Times: Tuesday, January 29, 1895" p 2; "The New Dunedin Gaol" p 4.

⁵² Hume "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice" (31 December 1894) p 3.

⁵³ "Otago Daily Times: Tuesday, January 29, 1895" p 2.

⁵⁴ "Otago Daily Times: Tuesday, January 29, 1895" p 2; "Otago Daily Times: Monday, February 11, 1895" p 2; "The New Dunedin Gaol" p 4. "Otago Daily Times:

stressed that the gaol was built using co-operative, rather than prison, labour.⁵⁵ By mid-1896, the brickwork of the administrative block had reached the level of the roof plate, and north and south sides of the building were three feet above the second-floor level.⁵⁶ In mid-1897 the roof was on, and by the end of the year the building was completed and occupied.⁵⁷ The £16,000 gaol opened to the public on Friday 10th, Saturday 11th, and Monday 13th June 1898, with reports of the 1,000 people visiting on Friday and Saturday inspecting "all parts of the building ... with a good deal of curiosity."⁵⁸

The design of the gaol

In early 1895 it was reported that the new gaol

Monday, June 13, 1898" p 2.

⁵⁵ "The New Dunedin Gaol" p 4.

⁵⁶ Hales "Appendix F. Annual Report on Public Works by the Engineer-in-Chief" (1 July 1896) p 59.

⁵⁷ Hales "Appendix F. Annual Report on Public Works by the Engineer-in-Chief" (1 July 1897) p 65. Hume "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice" (31 December 1897) p 3.

⁵⁸ This would be equivalent to over \$3.6 million in 2023 (2nd quarter). Reserve Bank of New Zealand. Inflation calculator np.; "Otago Daily Times: Monday, June 13, 1898" p 2. Torrance "[Letter to Editor] Visitors to the New Gaol this evening" p 2; Torrance "[Letter to the Editor] Visitors to the New Gaol" p 2; "Turf Chit Chat" p 2. "Otago Daily Times: Tuesday, June 14, 1898" p 2.

would "somewhat resemble the new police station," which is a brick building "of the Elizabethan order of architecture," fronting Gaol and High Streets.⁵⁹ But apart from material similarities, Campbell drew on more contemporary sources for his design. Comparison of its "striped brickwork, white moulding on gables, corner turrets, Indian or Islamic domes, delicate spikes, round windows and brick piers" with Norman Shaw's New Scotland Yard (London, 1891)⁶⁰ has assured attention on the building has been primarily focussed on its exterior, with only token descriptions or evaluations of its interior.⁶¹

⁵⁹ "Otago Daily Times: Tuesday, January 29, 1895" p 2. "The New Police Station" p 2.

⁶⁰ Martin *Built for Us* p 48, Galer "Perfect fit" p 52; Hodgson *Looking at the Architecture of New Zealand* p 36 [caption]; McGill & Sheehan "The Official Court and Scottish Baronial Constabulary Structures" p 228; Richardson "An Architecture of Empire" p 4; Shaw *New Zealand Architecture* p 65; McCoy & Blackman *Victorian City of New Zealand* Plate 36.

⁶¹ For example, Hodgson stated that behind its façade "lay a prison of almost sadistic quality" (Hodgson *Looking at the Architecture of New Zealand* p 36 [caption]), and McGill referred to "the primitive three-storey cell block" and "the twilight zone behind clanging doors and iron bars." McGill & Sheenan "The Official Court and Scottish Baronial Constabulary Structures" p 228.

The interior is a significant departure from Burrow's Mount Cook Prison design. It was planned as two parts - a two-storey administrative block and chapel with a three-storey cell block, with 72 separate cells 7ft 6 in by 9ft (2.3m x 2.7m), and a building of 105ft 9in by 130 ft 3in (32.2m x 39.7m).⁶² The cells were lit by gas and provided space for a daytime table and a hammock at night, with floors of composite asphalt and concrete under heart red pine (rimu) floorboards.⁶³

The interior of the building (and access to the male and female exercise yards) is organised by corridors with four stone staircases providing vertical circulation.⁶⁴ In the administration block a central corridor accessed a surgeon's room, warders' rooms, a lavatory and visitor spaces, while in the cell blocks "open corridors" or arcades mediated the space between the row of cells and the central exercise yards.⁶⁵

Like Mount Cook, Dunedin Gaol followed the precedent of Wormwood Scrubs by not

⁶² "Otago Daily Times: Monday, June 13, 1898" p 2; "The New Dunedin Gaol" p 4.

⁶³ "The New Dunedin Gaol" p 4.

⁶⁴ "The New Dunedin Gaol" p 4.

⁶⁵ "The New Dunedin Gaol" p 4.

including toilets in cells, but instead of ablution towers, a pair of toilet stalls was provided at the end of each row of cells. Unlike Mount Cook, work was not provided on site, with Dunedin prisoners involved in public works, ranging from building roads to providing parks. The importance of providing formal exercise yards no doubt reflected less flexibility in the provision of work during poor weather in contrast to Mount Cook's seemingly extensive workshops. Another difference between the two prisons was that Mount Cook retained the role of the central nave as view shaft, while at Dunedin corridors became arcades pressed up against open exterior walls, forming a layer of transparency across which prison guards could survey moving prisoners.

Historical analysis

The gaol is typically described as a courtyard prison. George Dance the Younger's 1769 courtyard design for London's Newgate⁶⁶ is probably the most famous courtyard prison, and, despite universal adoration for its façade,⁶⁷ its functioning and interior were

⁶⁶ Evans *The Fabrication of Virtue* p 109

⁶⁷ For example, Summerson and Fletcher. Evans *Fabrication of Virtue* p 109; Fletcher "Recent Development of Early Renaissance in England" p 35.

severely criticised through into the nineteenth century, most notably in the first report of the British Inspectors of Prisons of 1836, which recommended its rebuilding along the lines of a Separate System prison.⁶⁸

Late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century polygonal prisons can also be considered to be courtyard-like, such as William Blackburn's Northleach House of Corrections (Gloucester, 1785), which employed a panopticon concept prior to Jeremy and Samuel Bentham's more famous proposal. At Northleach, a stationary governor looked across the airing yards toward the doors of prisoners' cells. Surveillance was primarily of the outside spaces where prisoners exercised. The similar location of administrative functions (relative to the cell blocks) at Dunedin,⁶⁹ meant that, like Northleach, the view at Dunedin Gaol is primarily an introverted one, as the building doubles as a perimeter wall with its back to the world around it. An exception is the women's exercise yard which sits as adjunct to the primary organising concept of the design.

Peter Richardson refers to designs in Edward

⁶⁸ Reports of the Inspectors pp 75-81.

⁶⁹ "The New Dunedin Gaol" p 4.

Robert Robson's 1874 *School Architecture* as a possible model for Campbell's work.⁷⁰ Robson (1835-1917) was chief architect to the London School Board (1871-84), Architect to the London School Board (c1884-1904), and Architect to the Scotch Education Department.⁷¹ *School Architecture* contains a number of plans for courtyard schools, including the Gymnasium in Liegnitz, the Kreuzschule in Dresden (Anton Dietrich, 1866) and the Imperial Gymnasium in Vienna (Friedrich von Schmidt, 1866) as well as Robson's own designs for the Aldenham Street School (1874) and the Haverstock Hill School (1874). Schematically there are two planning concepts that are shared across these designs and Dunedin Gaol:

- (a) a central corridor through the front block of the building, and
- (b) one-sided corridors or arcades around 2-3 sides of the courtyard

Additionally, Robson's designs of Aldenham

⁷⁰ Educational architecture has a long history of the quadrangle, which like the basilica - and for that matter the prison cell, is ultimately a religious interior architecture, with the precedent of monastic cloisters, later adopted by educational institutions, such as Oxford.

⁷¹ "Robson, Edward Robert 1835-1917" np.

Street and Haverstock Hill schools bite off corners of the building. These emphasise the difference (rather than the unity) of the component parts of the building in what conventionally might be considered "bad architecture," but which provide (sometimes awkwardly-shaped) light wells, perhaps anticipating or responding to the built-up nature of the urban sites that these London schools could be built on. Missing corners are also apparent in the Dunedin Gaol design, stepping the cell blocks back from the street, providing greater emphasis on the Scotland Yard-like façade, and distancing it from the cell blocks. The concave corners also provide for natural light to enter the otherwise dark ends of the open corridors perimetering the internal courtyard. These coincidences make for a compelling argument for Richardson's identification of *School Architecture* as influencing Campbell's design. The location of an 1874 copy of Robson's book in the National Library, having been transferred from the Parliamentary Library further strengthens the likelihood.⁷² However, there is no evidence Campbell had designed schools by this date, that role being one for architects employed by Education Boards rather than

⁷² "School Architecture [catalogue entry]" np.

central government, challenging Campbell's awareness of, or need to consult, the Robson text.⁷³

Consequently, it is worth further investigating the extent of the influence of Shaw's New Scotland Yard on Dunedin Gaol. New Scotland Yard also had a courtyard, and a combination of central corridors and arcades. The section through the building looking North appears to detail police cells defined by brick arcading. It is a simple jump to replicate these and create an internal elevation from the courtyard that is not dissimilar to that at Dunedin gaol. A photograph of Shaw's building was published in the July-September 1892 issue of *Architectural Record*. It gave pride of place to a corner turret and was followed by an image of (and praise for) Newgate prison's façade - but it did not present plans or sections of Shaw's design documenting the interior.⁷⁴ A description in

⁷³ Campbell was articled to and then worked for Glaswegian architect John Gordon (1872-79) who did design schools, including Crookston (1886 additions) and Calton (1890), but these appear to have been designed after Campbell had left his office. Richardson "An Architecture of Empire" p 11; "Glasgow, Crookston Street School" np.; "Kerr Street School" np.

⁷⁴ Fletcher "Recent Development of Early Renaissance in England" pp 34, 36.

The Times of May 1890 stated that: "The whole is built round a court 60ft by 55 ft,"⁷⁵ but the most public access to the details of New Scotland Yard may have been the exhibition of drawings (by his pupil Gerald Horsley (1862-1917)) in the Architectural Room at the Royal Academy in 1890.⁷⁶ But again the question is how would Campbell have accessed knowledge of the design beyond that of the more widely published exterior image and the general description of the building's

⁷⁵ "New Scotland Yard" (3 May 1890) p 6. The description continued stating that "The chimney-stacks are few in number, absolutely square, and decidedly prison-like ... it has potentialities, such as a spacious and fairly lighted crypt, in which men may be kept in reserve in the event of an expected riot, of which space does not permit the enumeration" ("New Scotland Yard" (3 May 1890) p. 6). The building was also described as the first large public building to use electric lighting ("New Scotland Yard" (17 June 1890) p 5).

⁷⁶ "The Royal Academy" p 13. The exhibition catalogue records the drawing/s as follows: "1838 New Scotland Yard: part of south front R. Norman Shaw, R.A." *The Exhibition of the Royal Academy of Arts* vol 122 p 55. Additionally, in 1901 *The Builder* stated that "there have been many views of New Scotland Yard published, but a measured drawing of a part of the structure in detail is rather a novelty, and may be an interesting possession to some of our readers," suggesting few measured drawings had been publicly accessible "Illustrations: Principal Entrance to New Scotland Yard" pp 292, [310]-[311].

organisation around an internal courtyard.⁷⁷

This difficulty is partly resolved by a exterior perspective and ground plan of Hanover Street School (built after *School Architecture*) that was published in *The Building News* in April 1879, just prior to Campbell leaving for New Zealand in the early 1880s. The same drawings had been exhibited at the Royal Academy the previous year⁷⁸ and illustrated the river-front façade of this multi-storey school building with three storeys of open and semi-open brick arcading, seemingly anticipating the interior elevations of the Dunedin cell blocks drawn from the internal courtyard. The design of the interior of Campbell's Dunedin Gaol can thus clearly be connected to both Robson's and Shaw's work, and it may not be a coincidence that all three architects had Scottish connections and that Campbell's employer (John Gordon) was the long-time president of the Glasgow Institute

⁷⁷ Campbell had arrived in New Zealand in 1882 (Richardson "An Architecture of Empire" p 14), though it is possible that he returned to London. A Mr and Mrs Campbell arrived from London in January 1890 on the s.s. Rimutaka ("[untitled]" (22 January 1890) p 3.), perhaps a delayed honeymoon following Campbell's wedding in April 1889?

⁷⁸ "1879 - Board School, Hanover Street, London" np.

of Architects.⁷⁹

Conclusion

Both Mount Cook Prison and Dunedin Gaol demonstrate the impact of changing ideas of prisons consequent to the International Penal Conferences which shifted a focus from separate confinement day and night to one of work, trades training and education requiring prisoners to move through prisons and spend much of their days outside of their prison cells. While Mount Cook's model of Wormwood Scrubs had derived from developments in hospital design, which quietly edited the Pentonville cell block, it appears that Richardson's speculation that developments in school architecture in London underpinned Campbell's Dunedin Gaol's design is highly likely, but it may have been the publication of Hanover Street School drawings, rather than *School Architecture*, that was crucial. Thus, in contrast to Burrows, who was reliant on the comprehensive investigations into prison architecture of his predecessor (William Clayton), it appears that John Campbell's design of Dunedin Gaol was informed by contemporary British architecture more generally, rather than any

⁷⁹ "Government Architects" p 249.

specific knowledge of prisons.

Common to both prisons though was the impact of changes in prison regime resulting in smaller cells, cells without toilets, and new relationships between corridors and surveillance of moving prisoners, most clearly seen in Dunedin Gaol.

REFERENCES

- "1879 - Board School, Hanover Street, London" *ArchiSeek*
<https://www.archiseek.com/2009/1879-board-schools-hanover-street-london/>
- Bell, Arthur "Appendix H. Report on Public Buildings by the Engineer in Charge" (31 March 1890) Public Works Statement by the Minister for Public Works, The Hon. Thomas Fergus (25 July 1890) *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* (1890) D-1: 30-43.
- Blackett, John. "Appendix I. Annual Report on Roads, Miscellaneous Works, Buildings, Etc., by the Engineer-in-Chief" (31 March 1888), Public Works Statement by the Minister for Public Works, The Hon. Edwin Mitchelson (18 August 1888) *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* (1888) D-1: 37- 41.
- Blackett, John. "The Engineer-in-Chief to the Hon. the Minister for Public Work. Appendix I. Annual Report on Roads, Miscellaneous Works, Buildings, and Defence Works by the Engineer-in-Chief" (31 March 1886) Public Works Statement by the Minister for Public Works, The Hon. Edward Richardson (25 June 1886) *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* (1886) D-1: 36-41.
- Bullar, G.T., "Newgate Gaol" Section of Proposed Cells" (No. 3). p. 5. Reports of the Inspectors appointed under the provisions of the Act 5 & 6 Will. IV. c. 38; to visit the different Prisons of Great Britain. I. Home District (Westminster: House of Commons, 22 March 1836)
- Burrows, P.F.M. "Enclosure in Appendix H: Annual Report on Public Buildings and other works, North Island" (31 March 1882), Public Works Statement by the Minister for Public Works, The Hon. Walter Woods Johnston (11 July 1882) *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* (1882) D-1: 51.
- Burrows, P.F.M. "Enclosure in Appendix I: Annual Report on Public Buildings and other works, North Island: The Architect to the Engineer in Charge, North Island " (31 March 1884) Public Works Statement by the Minister for Public Works, The Hon. Edward Richardson, 24 October 1884 *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* (1884) Session II D-1: 47-48.
- Burrows, P.F. M. "Tenders are invited "[Works at Mount Cook]" *Evening Post* (4 February 1882):3.
- "The Courts: Supreme Court - Civil Sittings: Saturday, November 23: Mahoney v. The Queen" *New Zealand Times* (25 November 1889):2.
- Crawford, J.A.B. "Hume, Arthur" *Te Ara: the Encyclopedia of New Zealand* <https://teara.govt.nz/en/biographies/2h55/hume-arthur>
- Crawford, William. Report of William Crawford, Esq., on the Penitentiaries of the United States (House of Commons, 11 August 1834)
- Eastlake, Charles Locke *Hints on Household Taste in Furniture, Upholstery, and Other Details* London: Longmans, Green, and Co, 1869
https://dahp.wa.gov/sites/default/files/HintsOnHouseholdTaste_Eastlake.pdf
- Evans, Robin *The Fabrication of Virtue* (Cambridge: University of Cambridge Press, 1982)
- The Exhibition of the Royal Academy of Arts MDCCCXC: The One Hundred and Twenty-Second* (London: William Clowes and Sons, 1890) vol 122.
<https://www.royalacademy.org.uk/art-artists/exhibition-catalogue/ra-sec-vol122-1890>
- Fletcher, Bannister F. "Recent Development of Early Renaissance in England" *Architectural Record* (July-September 1892) 2(1):31-43.
- Galer, Lois "Perfect fit - but not for the police!" *Bricks and Mortar* (Dunedin: Allied Press Ltd, November 1982):52-53.

- "Glasgow, Crookston Street School" *Canmore: national Record of the Historic Environment* <https://canmore.org.uk/site/203949/glasgow-crookston-street-school>
- "Government Architects: Two Retirements" *New Zealand Building Progress* (July 1922):249.
- Hales, William H. "Appendix F. Annual Report on Public Works by the Engineer-in-Chief" (1 July 1896) Public Works Statement by the Minister for Public Works, The Hon. W. Hall-Jones (2 October 1896) *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* (1896) Session II D-1: 49-60.
- Hales, William H. "Appendix F. Annual Report on Public Works by the Engineer-in-Chief" (1 July 1897) Public Works Statement by the Minister for Public Works, The Hon. W. Hall-Jones (14 December 1897) *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* (1897) D-1: 54-67.
- Hales, William H. "Appendix G. Annual Report on Public Works by the Engineer-in-Chief (31 March 1892) Public Works Statement by the Minister for Public Works, The Hon. R.J. Seddon (27 September 1892) *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* (1892) D-1:28-33.
- Hales, William H. "Cost of Mount Cook Prison" *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* (1891) D-20 1p.
- Hodgson, Terence *Looking at the Architecture of New Zealand* (New Zealand: Grantham House, 1990).
- House of Representatives "Dunedin Gaol" *Hansard* (3 July 1894):194-195.
- Hume, A. "Tenders for Mount Cook do not include" *Evening Post* (29 November 1884) p. 3.
- Hume, Arthur "Report of Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice" (1 June 1884) *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* H-5 (1884) 20pp.
- Hume, Arthur "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice, Prisons Department" (31 December 1884) *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* H-6 (1885) 20pp.
- Hume, Arthur, "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice, Prisons Department" (31 March 1886) *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* (1886) H-4, 20pp.
- Hume, Arthur "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice, Department of Justice, Prisons Branch (Report on)" (31 December 1887) *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* (1888) H-2, 16pp.
- Hume, Arthur "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice, Department of Justice, Prisons Branch (Report on)" (31 December 1888) *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* H-7 (1889) 17pp.
- Hume, Arthur "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice, Department of Justice, Prisons Branch (Report on)" (31 December 1890) *Appendix of the Journal to the House of Representatives* (1891) Session II H-14, 14pp.
- Hume, Arthur "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice, Department of Justice, Prisons Branch (Report on)" (31 December 1891) *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* (1892) H-13, 13pp.
- Hume, Arthur "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice, Department of Justice, Prisons Branch (Report on)" (31 December 1892) *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* (1993) H-27, 14pp.
- Hume, Arthur "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice, Department of Justice, Prisons Branch (Report on)" (31 December 1893) *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* (1894) H-10, 13pp.

- Hume, Arthur "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice, Department of Justice, Prisons Branch (Report on)" (31 December 1894) Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives (1895) H-20 13pp.
- Hume, Arthur "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice, Department of Justice, Prisons Branch (Report on)" (31 December 1896) *Appendix of the Journal to the House of Representatives* (1897) Session II H-20 15pp.
- Hume, Arthur "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice, Department of Justice, Prisons Branch (Report on)" (31 December 1897) *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* (1898) H-20 14pp.
- Hume, Arthur "The Inspector of Prisons to the Hon. the Minister of Justice, Department of Justice, Prisons Branch (Report on)" (31 December 1898) *Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives* (1899) H-20, 15pp.
- "Illustrations: Principal Entrance to New Scotland Yard" *The Builder* (23 March 1901) LXXX (303 3):292, [310]-[311].
- Johnston *Forms of Constraint: A History of Prison Architecture* (Urbana; Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 2000)
- "Kerr Street School" *The Glasgow Story*
<https://www.theglasgowstory.com/image/?inum=TGSA02495>
- McCoy, E.J. and J.G. Blackman *Victorian City of New Zealand* (Dunedin: John McIndoe Ltd, 1968)
- McGill, David and Grant Sheehan "The Official Court and Scottish Baronial Constabulary Structures" *Landmarks: Notable Historic Buildings of New Zealand* (Auckland: Godwit Publishing, 1997) pp. 228-229.
- Martin, Lewis E. *Built for Us: The Work of Government and Colonial Architects, 1860s to 1960s* (Dunedin: University of Otago Press, 2004)
- "Meeting of Creditors" *Evening Post* (3 December 1894):2.
- "Mr Seddon and the New Gaol" *Evening Star* (29 June 1894):4.
- "Mount Cook: University or Barracks?" *Free Lance* (18 August 1900):6.
- Mount Cook Gaol Wellington, alterations to barracks contract, plan elevation section and details (1884) Ref: R25272638, Archives New Zealand, Wellington
- Mount Cook Gaol Wellington, alterations to barracks contract, plan elevation section and details (1884) Ref: R25272643, Archives New Zealand, Wellington
- "The New Dunedin Gaol" *Otago Daily Times* (13 April 1896):4.
- "The New Gaol" *Evening Star* (8 November 1894):2.
- "The New Police Station" *Evening Star* (31 May 1890):2.
- "New Scotland Yard" *The Times* (London) (3 May 1890):6.
- "New Scotland Yard" *The Times* (London) (17 June 1890):5.
- "No Gaol on Mount Cook" *New Zealand Times* (11 May 1898):2.
- "Otago Daily Times: Tuesday, January 29, 1895" *Otago Daily Times* (29 January 1895):2.
- "Otago Daily Times: Monday, February 11, 1895" *Otago Daily Times* (11 February 1895):2.
- "Otago Daily Times: Monday, June 13, 1898" *Otago Daily Times* (13 June 1898):2.
- "Otago Daily Times: Tuesday, June 14, 1898" *Otago Daily Times* (14 June 1898):2.
- Our Correspondent "Action Against the Government: Important Case" *Press* (23 November 1889):5.
- "Our Lithographic Illustrations" *Building News* (25 April 1879):444, 444f.
- Own Correspondent "Parliamentary Gossip: A Dunedin Architect's Petition" *Thames Star* (12 August 1890):2
- "Parliament: House of Representatives: Friday, August 21" *New Zealand Times* (25 August 1883):2.

- "Parliament: House of Representatives: Thursday, August 7: The Petition of Daniel Mahoney" *New Zealand Times* (8 August 1890):3
- "Parliament on Mount Cook: The Hon. Mr. Larnach's Proposition" *Evening Post* (9 October 1897):6.
- "Political Notes" *Temuka Leader* (28 August 1890):2.
- Poore, Patricia "Aesthetic Movement Interiors 1872-1889" *Old House Journal* (December 2018) <https://www.oldhouseonline.com/interiors-and-decor/aesthetic-interiors-1872-1889/>
- Pratt, John *Punishment in a Perfect Society: the New Zealand penal system 1840-1939* (Wellington: Victoria University Press, 1992).
- "The proposed New Gaol" *Evening Post* (30 September 1881):2.
- Reports of the Inspectors appointed under the provisions of the Act 5 & 6 Will IV c38 to visit the different Prisons of Great Britain: Home District (House of Commons, 22 March 1836)
- Reserve Bank of New Zealand. Inflation calculator <https://www.rbnz.govt.nz/monetary-policy/about-monetary-policy/inflation-calculator>
- Richardson, Peter "An Architecture of Empire: the Government Buildings of John Campbell in New Zealand" (Christchurch: University of Canterbury MA (Art History) thesis, 1988)
- "Robson, Edward Robert 1835-1917" *AHRnet: Biographical Dictionary of British and Irish Architects 1800-1950* <https://architecture.arthistoryresearch.net/architects/robson-edward-robert>
- "The Royal Academy: Fifth and Concluding Notice" *The Times* (London) (4 July 1890):13.
- "School Architecture. Being practical remarks on the planning, designing, building, and furnishing of school-houses ... By Edward Robert Robson [catalogue entry]" *National Library* <https://natlib.govt.nz/records/44838963>
- Shaw, Peter *New Zealand Architecture: From Polynesian Beginnings to 1990* (Auckland: Hodder & Stoughton, 1991)
- Stacpoole, John *Colonial Architecture in New Zealand* (Wellington A.H. & A.W. Reed, 1976)
- "The Temuka Leader: Saturday, November 21, 1896: Political Corruption: Conservative Government Corruption" *Temuka Leader* (21 November 1896):2.
- Torrance, J.A. "[Letter to the Editor] Visitors to the New Gaol" *Evening Star* (13 June 1898):2.
- Torrance, J.A. "[Letter to Editor] Visitors to the New Gaol this evening" *Otago Daily Times* (13 June 1898):2.
- "Turf Chit Chat" *Evening Star* (13 June 1898):2.
- "Typhoid" *Wanganui Chronicle* 913 April 1892):2.
- "[untitled]" *Evening Post* (18 June 1886):2.
- "[untitled]" *Press* (22 January 1890):3.
- "Victoria College: Views of the Wellington Chamber of Commerce" *Daily Telegraph* (15 August 1900):3.
- "A visit to Mount Cook Gaol" *New Zealand Times* (14 January 1897):2.